



Issue 19
(Winter 2009)

Romantic Textualities is available on the web @ www.cf.ac.uk/encap/romtext

ISSN 1748-0116

Romantic Textualities: Literature and Print Culture, 1780–1840, 19 (Winter 2009). Online: Internet (date accessed): <www.cf.ac.uk/encap/romtext/issues/rt19.pdf>.

© 2009 Centre for Editorial and Intertextual Research

Published by the Centre for Editorial and Intertextual Research, Cardiff University. Typeset in Adobe Garamond Pro 11 / 12.5, using Adobe InDesign cs4; images and illustrations prepared using Adobe Illustrator cs4 and Adobe PhotoShop cs4; final output rendered with Adobe Acrobat 9 Professional.

Editor: Anthony Mandal, Cardiff University, UK

Associate Editor: Tim Killick, Independent Scholar

Reviews Editor: Nicola Lloyd, Cardiff University, UK

Advisory Board

Peter Garside (Chair), University of Edinburgh, UK Jane Aaron, University of Glamorgan, UK Stephen Behrendt, University of Nebraska, USA Emma Clery, University of Southampton, UK Benjamin Colbert, University of Wolverhampton, UK Edward Copeland, Pomona College, USA Gavin Edwards, University of Glamorgan, UK Gillian Dow, University of Southampton / Chawton House Library, UK Caroline Franklin, University of Swansea, UK Isobel Grundy, University of Alberta, Canada David Hewitt, University of Aberdeen, UK Gillian Hughes, Independent Scholar Claire Lamont, University of Newcastle, UK Robert Miles, University of Victoria, Canada Rainer Schöwerling, University of Paderborn, Germany Christopher Skelton-Foord, University of Durham, UK Kathryn Sutherland, University of Oxford, UK

Aims and Scope: Formerly Cardiff Corvey: Reading the Romantic Text (1997–2005), Romantic Textualities: Literature and Print Culture, 1780–1840 is an online journal that is committed to foregrounding innovative Romantic-studies research into bibliography, book history, intertextuality, and textual studies. To this end, we publish material in a number of formats: among them, peer-reviewed articles, reports on individual/group research projects, bibliographical checklists, and biographical profiles of overlooked Romantic writers. As of Issue 15 (Winter 2005), Romantic Textualities also carries reviews of books that reflect the growing academic interest in the fields of book history, print culture, intertextuality, and cultural materialism, as they relate to Romantic studies.

BOOK REVIEWS 81

4. Vincent Newey, 'Rival Cultures: Charles Dickens and the Byronic Legacy', *Byron Journal*, 32 (2004), 85–100.

Ceri Hunter University of Oxford

Walter Scott, *Peveril of the Peak*, edited by Alison Lumsden (Edinburgh: EUP; New York: Columbia University Press, 2007; Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels, 14), xvi + 744pp. ISBN 978-0-7486-0578-1; £50 (hb).

PEVERIL OF THE PEAK has never been regarded as one of Walter Scott's greatest novels and its relative failure to achieve critical success is often attributed to the 'over-production and money-spinning' that many see as characteristic of his writing in the 1820s. In the 'Historical Note' to the current edition, Alison Lumsden puts this judgement in context: while 1821-23 marked a period of phenomenal output for Scott, she emphasises the extent to which he was in command of his historical material, despite his denial of any attempt at strict historical veracity in the 'Prefatory Letter' to the work. Scott's novels may have been written quickly and under commercial pressure, but their characters, themes, and contexts usually evolved more slowly over extended periods of time. As Lumsden points out, Scott had long been interested in the seventeenth century, and had already treated the Civil War in a Scottish context in Old Mortality (1816) and The Heart of Mid-Lothian (1818), as well as coming across relevant material in his editions of Dryden (1808), Somers' Tracts (1809-14), and Anthony Hamilton's Memoirs of Count Grammont (1811). It was, or so it seems, only a matter of time before he turned his attention to the period in an English context.

The result was a finer and more complicated work than contemporary and later critics have acknowledged. The first volume of Peveril of the Peak deals with the Civil War, Commonwealth, and early part of the Restoration. The remaining three volumes consider the series of accusations and counteraccusations that characterised the Popish Plot against Charles II. Lumsden's edition of the novel carefully and judiciously surveys the manuscript, author's proofs, first edition, later and collected editions, and the relevant parts of the Interleaved Set and Magnum Opus in order to present 'an ideal first-edition of the text', incorporating 'manuscript and proof readings which were lost through misreading, misunderstanding, or straightforward transcription error during the complex process of converting Scott's holograph into the four volumes which constitute the novel as published'. There are over 2,000 emendations to the base-text of this edition, of which approximately 1,900 come from the manuscript; twenty-five from the proofs; forty from the collected Novels and Romances edition; and nineteen from the Interleaved Set and Magnum Opus. A further twenty-four have been made editorially. As the aim of the volume is

to produce an ideal first edition, later editions, including the Interleaved Set and Magnum, are referred to only when they correct a clear error.

Even by the high standards of the Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels, Lumsden's 'Essay on the Text', 'Emendation List', 'Historical Note', 'Explanatory Notes', and 'Glossary' are commendably detailed. Her 'Essay on the Text' provides an overview of the genesis and composition of the novel, as well as a lengthy description of later editions and the present text, including revealing insights into the publishing environment in which the novel was produced, and the influence of contemporary intermediaries in its various stages of conception and composition. The section on the composition of the text in particular not only provides a fascinating example of the way in which Scott, Ballantyne, and Cadell worked together, but also of the creative transformations that continued to take place at every stage of the publication schedule. Lumsden has done an impressive amount of research on manuscripts, letters, and publisher's archives; in particular, she provides a detailed account of the printing and production schedule of *Peveril* based on the meticulous descriptions of the whereabouts of the proofs by Scott's publishers in order to avoid their theft and trade on the black market. The descriptions of Scott's alterations and extensions to the manuscript and proofs—the most important of which were his decision to extend the London material and to expand the novel to four volumes rather than the usual three—are also exemplary in their detail and clarity.

As the Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels has so decisively reminded us, the transmission history of Scott's texts is difficult and complex. Scott himself did not always seem to have checked the proofs against his manuscripts, and many errors and changes were unknowingly proliferated by him in the Magnum Opus. The Edinburgh Edition proceeds on the basis that an authoritative work is to be 'found not in the artist's manuscript, but in the printed book', but its basic working assumption is that 'what is written by the author is more valuable than what is generated by compositors and proof-readers'. The edition therefore aims to be as true as possible to Scott's 'initial creative process' and, hence, to reject what David Daiches in his 'Forward' calls the 'almost suffocating' nature of the Magnum Opus. Despite criticism of this approach and a renewed scholarly interest in the creative nature of the Magnum paratexts, David Hewitt rightly points out in his 'General Introduction' that while 'a new edition based on the Magnum would be an entirely legitimate project' the 'Edinburgh editors have chosen another valid option'.

Hewitt's newly revised introduction argues that his original assessment of the importance of the Edinburgh Edition 'now looks tentative and tepid, for the textual strategy pursued by the editors has been justified by spectacular results'. His claims are borne out by the current volume. Lumsden has uncovered an extraordinary number of oversights and emendations to the base-text, many of which shed new light on passages of the novel, as well as on Scott's authorial practices; in particular, both the newly revised reading text and accompanying

BOOK REVIEWS 83

editorial apparatus more clearly delineate the working relationship between Scott and his intermediaries. The Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels and this edition of *Peveril of the Peak* must therefore be welcomed not only for their impeccable scholarship and editorial policy, but also for making more transparent the complex 'socialisation' of Scott's novels.

Walter Scott, *The Siege of Malta and Bizarro*, edited by J. H. Alexander, Judy King, and Graham Tulloch (Edinburgh: EUP; New York: Columbia University Press, 2008), xiv + 511pp. ISBN 978-0-7486-2487-4; £55 (hb).

Visiting Sir Walter Scott at J. G. Lockhart's house in London just before Scott's final voyage to Malta and Italy in 1831, the Irish poet Thomas Moore reflected sadly in his journal on Scott's series of debilitating strokes and was more than once 'painfully struck by the utter vacancy of his look'. Moore claimed that the Lockharts' 'great object in sending [Scott] abroad' was 'to disengage his mind from the strong wish to write by which he is haunted—continually making efforts to produce something, without being able to bring his mind collectedly to bear upon it'. While the extent of Scott's vacancy and lack of intellectual consistency is perhaps overstated here—indeed, he is described as being more receptive and convivial during two further visits by Moore—his final two incomplete works written in 1831–32 while convalescing abroad, The Siege of Malta and Bizarro, both bear the imprint of his illness and present a different set of challenges from those facing the editors of the Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels.

On Lockhart's recommendation, neither text was revised or published by Robert Cadell after Scott's death, and the editorial concerns of the Edinburgh Edition—the attempt to resolve textual variations between the manuscripts and published works, the desire to produce an ideal first edition, and the rejection of the paratextual intricacies of the Magnum Opus—are therefore largely irrelevant in the present case. The novels are incomplete in more ways than one: Bizarro is quite literally unfinished and until now has remained wholly unpublished; The Siege of Malta finishes mid-sentence, increasingly elides its fictional narrative for a historical account of Malta, and has been published only in fragments. The manuscripts of the novels, primarily preserved in the Berg Collection at the New York Public Library, are, moreover, locally faulty, and are written in Scott's (by then) stricken and sometimes undecipherable hand.

None of this makes for an easy editorial commission, but in this meticulous edition by J. H. Alexander, Judy King, and Graham Tulloch every attempt has been made to provide the reader with all the requisite tools for scholarly and more general use. The edition presents the texts in 'three parallel forms': scans of the manuscripts on CD-ROM; 'reading' texts, in which the editors have attempted to act almost as contemporaneous intermediaries would have done by correcting straightforward errors, tidying punctuation, and filling

Notes on Contributors



Benjamin Colbert is Senior Lecturer in English Literature at the University of Wolverhampton. His main areas of interest are travel writing and satire, and his publications include vol. 3 of Pickering & Chatto's 'British Satire, 1785–1840' series: Complete Longer Satires (2003) and Shelley's Eye: Travel-Writing and Aesthetic Vision (2005). He is also the Reviews Editor for the European Romantic Review and has co-edited with Glyn Hambrook a special issue of Comparative Critical Studies, entitled 'Literature Travels' (2007).

Gavin Edwards is Professor of English Studies at the University of Glamorgan, Wales. His research focuses on Romantic literature and society, and historical applications of narrative theory and semantics. He is the editor of *George Crabbe: Selected Poems* (1991) and *Watkin Tench: Letters from Revolutionary France* (2001), and the author of *Narrative Order, 1789–1819: Life and Story in an Age of Revolution* (2005). He is currently working on capital letters in the novels of Dickens.

Porscha Fermanis is a lecturer in Romantic and eighteenth-century literature at University College Dublin. Her research interests include Enlightenment history and philosophy, as well as Romantic-era poetry, historical fiction, and historiography. Her book, *John Keats and the Ideas of the Enlightenment*, will appear with Edinburgh University Press in late 2009.

Peter Garside is an Honorary Professorial Fellow at the University of Edinburgh. He has recently edited Walter Scott's *Waverley* (2007) for the Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels, and was the Project Director of the online database *Illustrating Scott* (2009).

Richard Hill completed his PhD at Edinburgh University in 2006, and is now teaching English at the University of Hawaii, Maui Community College. His thesis was entitled 'The Illustration of the Waverley Novels in Scotland: Walter Scott's Contribution to the Nineteenth-Century Illustrated Novel'. He has written articles on Scott, Hogg, and book illustration, and is currently working on the lifetime illustrations of Robert Louis Stevenson.

Ceri Hunter is a DPhil student at Oxford University. Her thesis examines the literary and cultural meanings of cousin love in the nineteenth-century novel. She teaches in the field of Victorian literature and has previously published in the *George Eliot Review*. Ceri completed her MA in English at Cardiff University in 2005, where she also developed interests in women's fiction and Welsh writing in English.

Markus Poetzsch is Assistant Professor of English at Wilfrid Laurier University, in Waterloo, Canada, where he specialises in British Romantic literature. His recent publications include 'Visionary Dreariness': Readings in Romanticism's Quotidian Sublime (2006) and his current research is focused on the intersections of pedestrianism, imagination, and memory in the literature of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

John Pruitt is Assistant Professor of English at the University of Wisconsin–Rock County. His publications on literature and on teaching and learning have appeared most recently in *Currents in Teaching and Learning, Library Quarterly*, and *Restoration and Eighteenth-Century Theatre Research*.

Don Shelton is a collector, researcher, and writer on miniature portraits from Auckland, New Zealand. His collection includes over 800 miniature portraits which, together with his research notes, can be viewed at http://portrait-miniature.blogspot.com. He finds research into sitters such as Sir Anthony Carlisle fascinating, and is frequently surprised at how much information can be gleaned via dedicated Internet research.

Maria Paola Svampa is a PhD Student at Columbia University. She specialises in nineteenth-century and Romantic poetry, and her chief interests are stylistics, prosody, and comparative approaches to literature. She has written about Letitia Landon and Arthur Hugh Clough. Her recent research has focused on intertextuality and the bourgeois culture of tourism in the literary annuals.

